

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 10084213 7

The materials produced herein  
are intended for the sole use  
of law students at the  
University of Toronto.

CASES AND MATERIALS ON FAMILY LAW

Volume 1

EDITED BY

BERNARD GREEN

104  
G72  
1184  
v. 1

LAW LIBRARY

SEP 17 1982

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

The materials produced herein  
are intended for the sole use  
of law students at the  
University of Toronto.

CASES AND MATERIALS ON FAMILY LAW

Volume 1

EDITED BY

BERNARD GREEN



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

## Table of Contents

### CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

I. <u>The Constitutional Framework: Division of Powers and Charter of Rights</u> .....	2
Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms.....	3
U.S. Bill of Rights.....	4
Note on Impact of Charter of Rights on Family Law.....	4
II. <u>The Legislative Framework</u> .....	7
III. <u>The Institutional Framework</u> .....	7
A. The Courts.....	7
B. Other Agencies.....	7
C. The Lawyer.....	8
Reisman, "Beyond the Call of Obvious Duty".....	8
Mnookin & Kornhauser, "Bargaining in the Shadow of the Law: The Case of Divorce".....	11
IV. <u>Some Views on the Family and Marriage</u> .....	14
Eekelaar, <u>Family Law and Social Policy</u> .....	14
Sage, "Dissolution of the Family under Swedish Law".....	22
Ryan, "Maintenance Obligations in a New Legal Concept of Marriage".....	24

### CHAPTER TWO: FORMATION OF THE FAMILY UNIT AND ANNULMENT

I. <u>Introduction</u> .....	28
II. <u>The Constitutional Issue</u> .....	29
Bushnell, "Family Law and the Constitution".....	29
III. <u>The Statutory Conditions</u> .....	30
A. Licence and formalities.....	30
Marriage Act.....	30
B. Effect of failure to comply with statutory conditions.....	34
Marriage Act.....	34
Friend, "Common Law Marriage in Ontario".....	35
Alspector.....	39
Friend, "Common Law Marriage in Ontario".....	41
C. Age and parental consent.....	43
Marriage Act.....	43
<u>Re Fox</u> .....	44

IV. <u>The Conditions Imposed by the Common Law</u> .....	46
A. Introduction.....	46
B. A man and a woman.....	47
C. Who are free to marry.....	48
Marriage Act.....	49
D. Who consent to marry each other.....	52
(1) Mental Capacity.....	52
Marriage Act.....	52
<u>Meilen v. Anderson</u> .....	53
<u>Chertkow v. Feinstein</u> .....	54
<u>Whitaker v. McNeilly</u> .....	57
<u>Webb</u> .....	59
<u>Re McGill</u> .....	59
(2) Mistake as to the nature of the ceremony.....	62
<u>Jiwani</u> .....	62
(3) Mental reservations.....	64
<u>Gardner</u> .....	64
<u>Iantsis</u> .....	66
(4) Duress.....	67
<u>Thompson</u> .....	67
<u>Truong (Malia)</u> .....	72
(5) Fraud.....	73
<u>Moss</u> .....	73
<u>H. v. C.</u> .....	74
E. And who are able to consummate the marriage.....	76
(1) What constitutes consummation.....	76
<u>Baxter</u> .....	76
<u>Wilkinson</u> .....	76
(2) Inability to consummate.....	77
(a) Physical.....	77
<u>Foster</u> .....	77
(b) Invincible repugnance.....	79
<u>Heil</u> .....	79
<u>Greenlees</u> .....	82

<u>Gajamugan</u> .....	84
<u>Foisy</u> .....	84
V. <u>Defences to a Nullity Action: Approbation or Insincerity</u> .....	87
<u>Hahlo, Nullity of Marriage in Canada</u> .....	87
A. Knowledge.....	89
<u>G. v. G.</u> .....	89
<u>B. v. B.</u> .....	92
B. <u>Conduct</u> .....	93
<u>R.E.L.</u> .....	93
<u>W. v. W.</u> .....	97
C. Delay and improper motive.....	101
<u>Clifford</u> .....	101
<u>Norman</u> .....	103
D. The effect of petitioner's own impotence.....	105
<u>Pettit</u> .....	105
VI. <u>The Nullity Decree</u> .....	108
A. Jurisdiction and other matters.....	108
B. Conflicts problems.....	108
C. Economic consequences.....	108
D. Children.....	108
 <u>CHAPTER THREE: DIVORCE</u>	
I. <u>Grounds</u> .....	109
A. General.....	109
Green, "The Divorce Act of 1968".....	110
Divorce Act.....	110
B. Immediate relief: the fault grounds.....	112
(1) Adultery.....	112
(a) What it is.....	112
<u>Orford</u> .....	112
<u>Dennis</u> .....	114
(b) Proving adultery.....	114

(i)	Standard of proof.....	114
(ii)	Methods.....	114
1.	Physical condition.....	114
2.	Circumstances.....	116
	<u>Little</u> .....	116
3.	Admissions.....	121
	Divorce Act.....	121
	Evidence Act.....	122
	<u>Ewasiuk</u> .....	123
	<u>Veysey</u> .....	124
4.	Other decrees.....	125
	<u>Coles</u> .....	125
(2)	Other sexual misconduct.....	127
	Divorce Act.....	127
	<u>G. v. G.</u> .....	128
	<u>Guy</u> .....	130
	<u>T. v. T. and W.</u> .....	131
(3)	Cruelty.....	133
	Divorce Act.....	135
(a)	Relevance of the common law alimony standard.....	135
	<u>N. v. N.</u> .....	135
(b)	Grave and weighty conduct.....	141
	<u>Knoll</u> .....	141
	<u>Feldman</u> .....	142
	<u>Wittstock</u> .....	144
	<u>Luther</u> .....	148
	<u>Shumila</u> .....	150
	<u>Hattie</u> .....	154
	<u>Rishel</u> .....	157
(c)	The relevance of intention.....	157
	<u>Williams</u> .....	158
	<u>Anderson</u> .....	164
(d)	The time problem.....	167
C.	Delayed relief: marital breakdown.....	167
	Divorce Act.....	167



(1)	Imprisonment.....	168
(2)	Addiction.....	168
(3)	Disappearance.....	169
(4)	Non-consummation.....	169
	<u>Chirayath</u> .....	169
(5)	Living separate and apart in the absence of other grounds.....	171
(a)	"Separate and apart".....	172
	<u>J.B. v. A.W.B.</u> .....	172
	<u>Deslippe</u> .....	176
	<u>Boechler</u> .....	178
	<u>Dorchester</u> .....	179
	<u>Lachman</u> .....	181
(b)	Desertion.....	186
(i)	Without just cause.....	186
	<u>Sullivan</u> .....	186
	<u>G. v. G.</u> .....	190
	<u>Bird</u> .....	192
	<u>Slon</u> .....	195
(ii)	...And with the intention to remain apart permanently.....	196
	<u>Lilley</u> .....	196
	<u>Kaczmarz</u> .....	201
(iii)	The problem of mutual desertion.....	204
	<u>Price</u> .....	204
(iv)	Termination of desertion.....	207
	<u>Digiacinto</u> .....	207
	<u>Richards</u> .....	208
	<u>March</u> .....	211
	<u>Gushta</u> .....	212
	<u>Harrison</u> .....	213
D.	Proposals for reform.....	217
	Goldstein & Gitter, "On Abolition of Grounds for Divorce".....	217

II. <u>Bars and Defences</u> .....	221
A. The possibility of reconciliation.....	221
Divorce Act.....	221
<u>Geransky</u> .....	222
Irving & Irving, "Conciliation Counselling In Divorce Litigation".....	226
<u>Ferguson</u> .....	229
B. Absolute bars applicable to all grounds.....	232
(1) Collusion.....	232
Divorce Act.....	232
Sopinka, "The Divorce Act 1968, Collusion Confined".....	233
<u>Gillett</u> .....	238
(2) Fraud.....	239
<u>Fromovitz</u> .....	239
C. Discretionary Bars.....	243
(1) Connivance.....	243
Divorce Act.....	243
Report of the Special Joint Committee ...on Divorce.....	243
<u>Berger</u> .....	244
(a) Consent.....	246
<u>T. v. T.</u> .....	246
(b) The problem of investigation.....	248
<u>Pearl</u> .....	248
<u>Hechter</u> .....	250
(c) Termination of connivance.....	255
<u>Godfrey</u> .....	255
(2) Condonation.....	258
(a) Introduction.....	258
Divorce Act.....	259
(b) The common law.....	260
<u>Knowledge, forgiveness and re-instatement</u> .....	261

	<u>Leaderhouse</u> .....	261
	<u>Aucoin</u> .....	267
(c)	The effect of the Divorce Act.....	269
	Divorce Act.....	269
	<u>Boivert v. Marineau</u> .....	270
	<u>Nolan</u> .....	274
	<u>Ross</u> .....	274
	<u>Blackburn</u> .....	275
	<u>Brown</u> .....	276
	<u>Blue</u> .....	278
(3)	The exercise of discretion.....	280
	Divorce Act.....	280
	<u>Blunt</u> .....	280
D.	Special bars applicable only to s. 4 grounds.....	281
	Divorce Act.....	281
	<u>Raggett</u> .....	282
	<u>Savage</u> .....	283
E.	The problem of insanity.....	285
	<u>B. v. B.</u> .....	285
III.	<u>Nature and Consequences of Divorce</u> .....	287
A.	Jurisdiction.....	287
	Divorce Act.....	287
B.	Recognition.....	289
	Divorce Act.....	289
C.	Consequences.....	289
(1)	Status.....	289
	Divorce Act.....	289
	<u>Baia</u> .....	290
(2)	Economic.....	294
(3)	Children.....	294
(4)	Costs.....	294
	<u>Bregman</u> .....	295

CHAPTER FOUR: ECONOMIC RELATIONS BETWEEN "SPOUSES"

I. <u>Introduction</u> .....	298
II. <u>Ownership of Property</u> .....	300
A. Introduction.....	300
Law Reform Commission of Canada, <u>Family Property</u> .....	300
Zuijdwijk, <u>A Note on the Standard Property Regime</u> <u>in Quebec</u> .....	313
B. The law prior to the F.L.R. Act; the law after: the use of trusts.....	318
<u>Murdoch</u> .....	319
<u>Rathwell</u> .....	327
<u>Pettkus v. Becker</u> .....	328
<u>Marvin</u> .....	338
C. The F.L.R. Act.....	339
(1) Provisions applicable to determining ownership of all types of assets.....	339
(a) Standing.....	339
(b) Trusts and presumptions of trust.....	340
(c) Private agreements: domestic contract.....	341
(2) Family assets and division of family and non-family assets.....	341
(a) What is a family asset?.....	342
(b) Powers of the court in dividing property.....	343
(i) General.....	343
(ii) In relation to family assets.....	344
(iii) In relation to non-family assets.....	345
D. The case law.....	346
(1) What is a family asset?.....	346
<u>Bregman</u> .....	346
<u>Ling</u> .....	350
<u>Re Leatherdale</u> .....	351
(2) When will the court make an unequal division of family assets?.....	352
(a) The effect of gifts.....	353

	<u>Silverstein</u> .....	353
	<u>Bregman</u> .....	355
	<u>Weir</u> .....	356
	<u>Ling</u> .....	357
	<u>Piskor</u> .....	358
(b)	Equal division inequitable in the circumstances.....	359
	<u>Weir</u> .....	359
	<u>Leatherdale</u> .....	361
(3)	When will the court make a division of non-family assets?.....	364
(a)	The impact of s. 4.....	364
	<u>Silverstein</u> .....	364
	<u>Bregman</u> .....	365
	<u>Re Young</u> .....	368
(b)	The impact of s. 8.....	369
	<u>Silverstein</u> .....	369
	<u>Re Young</u> .....	370
	<u>Van de Mark v. Walton</u> .....	372
	<u>Kiss v. Palachik</u> .....	373
(4)	The problem of agreements between the parties.....	374
	Family Law Reform Act.....	375
(a)	Agreements not in compliance with s. 54.....	376
	<u>Seibt</u> .....	376
	<u>Burton</u> .....	377
(b)	Agreements that are formally valid by s. 54.....	378
	<u>Deroon</u> .....	378
	<u>Couzens</u> .....	380
	<u>Mirus</u> .....	380a
	<u>Lamers</u> .....	380a
III.	<u>Mutual Duty of Maintenance</u> .....	381
A.	While Married or Cohabiting.....	381
(1)	The law prior to the F.L.R. Act of 1978.....	381
(2)	The Family Law Reform Act of 1978.....	383
B.	On Breakup of Marriage or Cohabitation.....	383
(1)	Who can claim: the problem of "common law" spouses.....	383

Family Law Reform Act.....	383
Re Stoikiewicz and Filas.....	384
<u>Warwick v. Ministry of Community &amp; Social Services</u> .....	386
<u>Sanderson v. Russell</u> .....	388
(2) When can claim be made?.....	389
(a) Nullity.....	389
(b) Divorce.....	389
Divorce Act.....	389
The Interaction of the Divorce Act and the F.L.R. Act.....	389
Note on the Powers of the Divorce Court.....	391
(c) On death of one of the parties.....	393
Succession Law Reform Act.....	393
(3) What types of order can be made.....	393
(a) Non-monetary.....	393
The special problem of possessory rights in the matrimonial home.....	394
(i) Definition of matrimonial home.....	395
(ii) Protection accorded a spouse in the matrimonial home.....	396
(iii) Powers of court to alter occupancy rights.....	396
<u>Janssen</u> .....	397
Partition Act.....	399
(b) Money Awards.....	400
(i) Periodic payment orders.....	400
Family Law Reform Act.....	400
Divorce Act.....	400
(ii) Lump sum.....	400
Family Law Reform Act.....	400
Divorce Act.....	401
<u>Murdoch</u> .....	401
<u>Shaffran</u> .....	402
<u>Feldman</u> .....	404
<u>Chaffery</u> .....	406
<u>Brett</u> .....	406
<u>Norgard</u> .....	409
Family Law Reform Act.....	410



Divorce Act.....	410
(4) Factors affecting monetary awards.....	411
(a) Introduction.....	411
Law Reform Commission of Canada, Maintenance or Divorce.....	411
Family Law Reform Act.....	417
Divorce Act.....	418
(b) Conduct.....	419
(i) Under the F.L.R. Act.....	419
<u>West</u> .....	419
<u>McCabe</u> .....	421
<u>Rocha</u> .....	423
<u>C. v. C. (No. 2)</u> .....	424
(ii) Under the Divorce Act.....	425
Murdoch.....	425
(c) Other factors.....	427
<u>Davis</u> .....	427
<u>Williams</u> .....	429
<u>Silverstein</u> .....	431
<u>D. v. D.</u> .....	435
<u>Cohen</u> .....	436
<u>Elasoff</u> .....	438
<u>Cure</u> .....	440
(5) Variation of awards.....	441
Family Law Reform Act.....	441
Divorce Act.....	442
<u>Harrington</u> .....	442
<u>Johnstone</u> .....	444
<u>McQuilkin v. Dawson</u> .....	447
<u>Neal</u> .....	449
<u>Jancov</u> .....	450
<u>Gergely</u> .....	453
<u>Gigantes</u> .....	455
C. Special Problems: Contracting Out, Welfare and Problems of Federalism.....	456
(1) Contracting out of maintenance.....	456
(a) While parties are alive.....	456
(i) During cohabitation or upon separation.....	456
Family Law Reform Act.....	456

(ii) Where marital status is terminated by divorce.....	457
<u>Newman</u> .....	457
Note on separation agreements.....	464
(b) Contracting out of claims against a spouse's estate.....	464
Family Law Reform Act.....	464
(2) Welfare	
General Welfare Assistance Act.....	465
Annual Report, Ministry of Community and Social Services for the Fiscal Year Ending March 31, 1981.....	468
Annual Report, Ministry of Community and Social Services for the Fiscal Year Ending March 31, 1979.....	469
Family Benefits Act.....	472
Annual Report, Ministry of Community and Social Services for the Fiscal Year Ending March, 1981.....	476
Annual Report, Ministry of Community and Social Services for the Fiscal Year Ending March, 1979.....	478
Diamond, "Philosophy of Welfare".....	479
(3) Problems of federalism.....	484
<u>Sniderman</u> .....	485

## CHAPTER FIVE: CHILDREN

I. <u>Introduction</u> .....	487
Children's Law Reform Act.....	488
Family Law Reform Act.....	489
Succession Law Reform Act.....	489
Divorce Act.....	490
II. <u>Proving and Disproving Parenthood</u> .....	490
Children's Law Reform Act.....	490
<u>Re H and H</u> .....	490
<u>Re Rhan</u> .....	494
<u>Ministry of Community and Social Services and Tolls</u> .....	502



III.	<u>The Right (or Privilege) to Raise or See One's Children:</u>	
	<u>Guardianship, Custody, Care and Control, Access.....</u>	504
A.	Introduction.....	504
B.	Private Disputes.....	505
(1)	Custody.....	505
(a)	Legislative framework.....	505
	Children's Law Reform Act.....	505
	Divorce Act.....	512
	Matrimonial Causes Act.....	513
(b)	The general principles: what the academics have said.....	515
	Foster and Freed, "Child Custody".....	515
	Katkin, Bullington and Levine, "Above and Beyond the Best Interests of the Child.....	522
	Mnookin, "Child-Custody Adjudication: Judicial Functions in the Face of Indeterminacy.....	534
(c)	Powers of the court.....	559
(i)	Award to a person not a party to the action.....	559
	<u>Re Fulford and Townshend.....</u>	559
(ii)	Joint custody order.....	562
	<u>Kruger.....</u>	562
	<u>McCabe.....</u>	569
	<u>Field.....</u>	571
(iii)	The effect of an agreement between the parties.....	574
	Children's Law Reform Act.....	574
	Family Law Reform Act.....	575
(d)	Interim custody.....	576
	Children's Law Reform Act.....	576
	Divorce Act.....	576
	<u>Dyment.....</u>	576
(e)	Permanent custody.....	578

(i)	The impact of conduct.....	578
	Divorce Act.....	578
	<u>In Re T (Infants)</u> .....	579
	<u>Cochrane</u> .....	581
	<u>Cooney</u> .....	583
	<u>Bezaire</u> .....	587
(ii)	Race.....	591
	<u>Hayre</u> .....	591
	<u>Singh</u> .....	593
(iii)	Tender years and plans.....	594
	<u>MacDonald</u> .....	594
	<u>Talsky</u> .....	596
	<u>Wakaluk</u> .....	601
	<u>Romeyko</u> .....	606
	Bayda, "Procedure in Child Custody Adjudication.....	608
(f)	Custody after death of natural guardian.....	613
	Children's Law Reform Act.....	613
(2)	Disputes between parents and third parties.....	614
	<u>Hepton v. Maat</u> .....	614
	<u>J. v. C.</u> .....	616
	<u>Re Moores and Feldstein</u> .....	621
	<u>Delvenne v. Nabbie</u> .....	629
(3)	Access.....	632
	Children's Law Reform Act.....	632
	<u>Ader</u> .....	634
	<u>Boileau</u> .....	639
	<u>Adoption of a Child by M.</u> .....	641
C.	Disputes involving the state or a coercive agency.....	644
(1)	State intervention: the "pure welfare" approach.....	644
	Manson, "The Ontario Child Welfare Act of 1965".....	644
	Child Welfare Act.....	650

(a) General.....	650
(b) Jurisdiction.....	651
(c) Process.....	658
(d) Powers on making a finding.....	663
(e) Accountability: reviews and appeals.....	665
Richardson, Unpublished paper .....	671
Ministry of Community and Social Services, 48th Annual Report.....	677
<u>Re C.C.A.S. and Pamela M.</u> .....	679
<u>Re Brady Infants</u> .....	689
<u>C.A.S. of Winnipeg v. Molyneux and     Porteous</u> .....	691
<u>Tom v. Winnipeg C.A.S.</u> .....	696
Note, "The Custody Question and Child Neglect Hearings".....	698
<u>Re Cordes - Saathoff et al and C.C.A.S.     of Metro Toronto</u> .....	705
(2) State intervention: the quasi-welfare approach.....	708
Juvenile Delinquents Act.....	708
Young Offenders Act.....	712
IV. <u>Adoption</u> .....	726
A. The statutory scheme.....	726
Child Welfare Act.....	726
Ministry of Community and Social Services, 48th Annual Report.....	741
B. Consent of natural parents.....	742
<u>O'Connor v. A. &amp; B.</u> .....	742
<u>Director of Man. Child Welfare v. Y.</u> .....	744
<u>Re Winsor</u> .....	747
<u>Re Sobering et al and Sergeant</u> .....	751
C. The religious factor.....	753
Petch, "Re Lamb: Religious considerations in Ontario Adoptions".....	753
<u>Re Lee</u> .....	756
D. The search for natural parents or child.....	758
Child Welfare Act.....	758
<u>Kelly v. Supt. Child Welfare</u> .....	760

E. Access.....	761
<u>C.G.W. v. M.J. et al</u> .....	761
<u>Williams v. Hillier and Hillier</u> .....	765
V. <u>The Parent-Child Relationship</u> .....	771
A. Parental Control.....	771
<u>Re D.</u> .....	772
B. Economic relations.....	775
(1) Parental obligations to child.....	775
(a) General.....	775
Ontario Law Reform Commission, "Report on the Age of Majority".....	775
(b) Legislative framework.....	778
Family Law Reform Act.....	778
Child Welfare Act.....	782
Divorce Act.....	783
(c) The work of the courts.....	784
<u>Waters v. Nicholls</u> .....	784
<u>Re Dolabaille and Carrington</u> .....	786
<u>Clark</u> .....	789
<u>Janzen</u> .....	791
<u>Gartner</u> .....	793
<u>Hock</u> .....	795
<u>Walls v. Hanson</u> .....	797
(d) The effect of death.....	798
Succession Law Reform Act.....	798
<u>Re Pfrimmer</u> .....	805
(2) The child's duty to maintain his parents.....	806
Family Law Reform Act.....	806
Succession Law Reform Act.....	808
 CHAPTER SIX: <u>PROTECTION OF THE FAMILY UNIT</u> <u>AGAINST INTERFERENCE BY THIRD PARTIES</u>	
I. <u>Between Husband and Wife</u> .....	811
Ontario Law Reform Commission Report on Family Law, Part I: Torts .....	811
Kelly, "The Case for Retention of Causes of Action for Intentional Interference with the Marital Relationship".....	817

Leaphart and McCann, "Consortium: An Action for the Wife".....	821
Ontario Law Reform Commission Report on Family Law, Part I: Torts.....	827
Family Law Reform Act.....	830
II. <u>Between Parent and Child</u> .....	830
Ontario Law Reform Commission Report on Family Law, Part I: Torts.....	830
Family Law Reform Act.....	833

